



---

Front Matter

Reviewed work(s):

Source: *Synthese*, Vol. 53, No. 2, Matters of the Mind (Nov., 1982)

Published by: [Springer](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20115793>

Accessed: 19/05/2012 10:57

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



Springer is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Synthese*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

VOLUME 53 No. 2 NOVEMBER 1982

---

# SYNTHESE

AN INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL  
FOR EPISTEMOLOGY, METHODOLOGY  
AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Editor-in-Chief: Jaakko Hintikka*

---

MATTERS OF THE MIND

*Edited by*

*Stephanie A. Ross and Paul A. Roth*

ISSN 0039-7857



D. REIDEL PUBLISHING COMPANY

DORDRECHT : HOLLAND / BOSTON : U.S.A.

# SYNTHESE

*An International Journal for Epistemology, Methodology and  
Philosophy of Science*

*Editors: Editor-in-Chief:*

DAVID GRUENDER  
Dept. of Philosophy, Florida State Univ.  
Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA

JAAKKO HINTIKKA  
Dept. of Philosophy, Florida State Univ.  
Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA

RISTO HILPINEN  
Institute of Philosophy  
Univ. of Turku  
20500 Turku 50, Finland

*Review Editor:*  
MERRILEE H. SALMON  
Dept. of Philosophy, Univ. of Pittsburgh  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260, USA

ESA SAARINEN  
Dept. of Philosophy  
Univ. of Helsinki, Unioninkatu 40B  
00170 Helsinki 17, Finland

*Managing Editor:*  
JAYNE MONEYSMITH  
Dept. of Philosophy, Florida State Univ.  
Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA

## *Editorial Board:*

David Berlinski, *Univ. of Puget Sound, Tacoma, Wash., U.S.A.*; Arthur W. Burks, *Univ. of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Mich., U.S.A.*; Robert E. Butts, *Univ. of Western Ontario, London, Ont., Canada*; Nancy Cartwright, *Stanford Univ., Stanford, Calif., U.S.A.*; Anne Fagot, *Paris, France*; Jens Erik Fenstad, *Univ. of Oslo, Oslo, Norway*; Kit Fine, *Univ. of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Mich. U.S.A.*; Dagfinn Føllesdal, *Univ. of Oslo, Oslo, Norway*; Hans Freudenthal, *Univ. of Utrecht, The Netherlands*; Marjorie Grene, *Univ. of California, Davis, Calif., U.S.A.*; Ian Hacking, *Stanford Univ., Stanford, Calif., U.S.A.*; Sandra Harding, *Univ. of Delaware, Newark, Del., U.S.A.*; Robert Howell, *State Univ. of New York at Albany, N. Y., U.S.A.*; Ilkka Niiniluoto, *Univ. of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland*; David Pears, *Christ Church, Oxford, U.K.*; Merrill Provence Hintikka, *Florida State Univ., Tallahassee, Fla., U.S.A.*; Vadim Sadovsky, *Academy of Science, Moscow, U.S.S.R.*; Wesley C. Salmon, *Univ. of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pa., U.S.A.*; J. J. C. Smart, *Australian National Univ., Canberra, Australia*; Joseph D. Sneed, *Colorado School of Mines, Golden, Colo., U.S.A.*; Wolfgang Stegmüller, *Univ. of Munich, Munich, B.R.D.*; Patrick Suppes, *Stanford Univ., Stanford, Calif., U.S.A.*; Klemens Szaniawski, *Univ. of Warsaw, Warsaw, Poland*; Richmond H. Thomason, *Univ. of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pa., U.S.A.*; Amos Tversky, *Stanford Univ., Stanford, Calif., U.S.A.*; Thomas Wasow, *Stanford Univ., Stanford, Calif., U.S.A.*

Publication programme, 1982: 4 volumes (12 issues), monthly. Subscription price per volume: Dfl. 163, – including postage. Private individuals (no institutions, libraries, etc.) may subscribe at the reduced rate of Dfl. 50, –. They should declare that the subscription is for their own personal use, that it will not replace any existing library subscription and that it will not be put at the disposal of any library. Subscriptions should be sent to the publisher, D. Reidel Publishing Company, P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, Holland, or to any subscription agent. *Private subscriptions should be sent direct to the publisher.* For advertisement rates and prices of back volumes apply to the publisher.

This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 21 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970, U.S.A.

The code on the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the article may be made for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients. This consent is given on the condition that the copier pay through the Copyright Clearance Center the per-copy fee stated in the code for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law. (Articles published prior to 1979 may be copied for a fee of \$ 1 per copy, also payable through the Center.) This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale.

Copyright © 1982 by D. Reidel Publishing Company. Printed in the Netherlands.

Second Class Postage Paid at New York, N.Y. (USPS 043250).

U.S. Mailing Agent: Expeditors of the Printed Word Ltd., 527 Madison Avenue (Suite 1217), New York, NY 10022.

## MATTERS OF THE MIND

### CONTENTS

*Volume 53 No. 2 November 1982*

STEPHANIE A. ROSS and PAUL A. ROTH / Preface	157
DANIEL C. DENNETT / How to Study Human Consciousness Empirically	159
RICHARD RORTY / Comments on Dennett	181
DOUGLAS R. HOFSTADTER / Who Shoves Whom Around inside the Careenium?	189
GUY L. STEELE, Jr. / Comments on Hofstadter	219
DEREK PARFIT / Personal Identity and Rationality	227
DONALD REGAN / Comments on Parfit	243
SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION	251
HARRY FRANKFURT / The Importance of What We Care About	257
ANNETTE C. BAIER / Caring about Caring: A Reply to Frankfurt	273
ALASDAIR MACINTYRE / Comments on Frankfurt	291
ALASDAIR MACINTYRE / How Moral Agents Became Ghosts	295
GERALD DWORKIN / Reply to MacIntyre	313
HARRY FRANKFURT / Comments on MacIntyre	319
RICHARD RORTY / Contemporary Philosophy of Mind	323
DANIEL DENNETT / Comments on Rorty	349



---

Preface

Author(s): Stephanie A. Ross and Paul A. Roth

Reviewed work(s):

Source: *Synthese*, Vol. 53, No. 2, Matters of the Mind (Nov., 1982), pp. 157-158

Published by: [Springer](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20115794>

Accessed: 19/05/2012 10:56

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



Springer is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Synthese*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

## PREFACE

The conference 'Matters of the Mind' was held at the University of Missouri-St. Louis October 28–30, 1981. Supported by a grant from the University's Weldon Spring Fund, the conference brought together ten philosophers to discuss present-day theories of the mind and their ramifications for other areas of our culture. This special issue of *Synthese* contains the papers read at that meeting.

In the first session Daniel Dennett and Douglas Hofstadter considered how consciousness might be constructed and how we might study it empirically. Dennett used an analogy with literary criticism to characterize an investigating strategy which he dubbed hetero-phenomenology, while Hofstadter's dialogue invoked a variety of metaphors, ranging from English garden mazes to "symm"ball machines, to show how a physical system could gain such 'mental' attributes as perception and thought, self-control and a soul.

While Dennett's and Hofstadter's papers showed how consciousness can be made a respectable object of study, the speakers on the second day addressed ethical implications of one or another picture of the mind. Derek Parfit argued that on the proper view of personal identity, classical prudence is indefensible. He speculated that morality must step in to fill this gap by rewarding paternalistic behavior. Harry Frankfurt offered an account of caring, claiming that a theory of what we care about must supplement philosophy's traditional concern with what we know (epistemology) and what we do (morality). Finally, Alasdair MacIntyre explored the relationship between changing notions of the self and changing theories of moral responsibility. He argued that Reid and Kant's moral theories could not appear without a new notion of choice as one entirely free of causal antecedents.

These discussions of mind and self, freedom and responsibility set the stage for the final paper on day three. Richard Rorty applied his magisterial overview of the philosophic art to the special case of philosophy of mind. He suggested that Dennett's brand of homuncular functionalism blends all that was best in logical behaviorism and

central state materialism. Dennett replied that this was about 0.742 correct; readers are left to draw their own conclusions.

We hope that readers of this issue derive as much pleasure and stimulation from the papers as we derived from the actual Conference sessions. We thank all our conferees who – both as speakers and discussants – helped to make ‘Matters of the Mind’ a success.

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Missouri-St. Louis  
St. Louis, MO 63121*

STEPHANIE A. ROSS  
PAUL A. ROTH